Dual Language Instruction & the Fight for Equity & Social Justice

June 7, 2022

Multistate Association for Bilingual Education - Northeast (MABE) for Citizens for Public Schools (CPS) Race & Education: Latinx Students Series

Susan McGilvray-Rivet
Mary Cazabon
Fabián Torres-Ardila
Phyllis Hardy
Agenda

1. Introduction
2. Student & Parent Voices
3. Learning Conditions of MA ELs and Students of Color
4. Research Supporting DLE
5. Challenges of Implementing DLE Programs
6. Teacher Voices
7. Questions
Less than 1 in 3 Black and Latino fourth graders are on grade level in reading – half the rate for the state’s White students.

Only 28 percent of low-income eighth graders are on grade level in math – again, less than half the rate for higher income students.

1 in 3 English learners don’t graduate on time – and 1 in 7 drop out of school entirely.

Less than 1 in 3 Black and Latino students who take the SAT meet college-readiness benchmarks in reading and math – compared to 2/3 of their White peers. Too many graduates of color don’t enroll in postsecondary education at all, and among those that do, too many have to take remedial courses.
Where Massachusetts Stands

- Latino students and students from low-income families are less likely to access early childhood education programs.
- Black and Latino students in Massachusetts are three times more likely than White students to be assigned to a teacher who lacks content expertise in the subject they teach.
- Black and Latino students are under-represented among students completing AP courses – and over-represented among students suspended out-of-school.

Source: #1 For Some report, September 2018
LOOK ACT

“Programs shall be based on best practices in the field and the linguistic and educational needs and the demographic characteristics of English learners in the school district.”

Language Opportunity for Our Kids Act, 2017
Dual Language Education

Massachusetts

- Approximately 40 DLE - Two-Way Immersion programs in 17 out of 351 districts
- Five districts with multiple programs
- LOOK Act, November 2017
  - In addition to SEI, districts can decide on adding bilingual programs
  - Eliminates restrictions for TBE programs, encourages DLE programs
  - Creates Bilingual Education Endorsement
  - Creates State Seal of Biliteracy Award
Massachusetts

Dual Language Education - Two-Way Immersion Programs
EL students are still overwhelmingly served in SEI programs.

What would it take to ensure that EL students and families have access to a wide range of quality program options?
Voices from the Field

Student Voices from Framingham
- Mahalia Cullen
- Isabela Perera

Parent Voice from Brockton
- Ivette Centeio
Learning Conditions of MA ELs and Students of Color

Dr. Fabian Torres Ardila is the Assistant Director at the Gastón Institute for Latino Community Development & Public Policy at the University of Massachusetts-Boston.
English Language Learners by the Numbers AY 2020
EL students represent 11% of all K-12 students in Massachusetts. Source: Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE).

EL students by Race/Ethnicity
N=102,861
- Hispanic: 69.6%
- Asian: 84.2%
- Black: 96.3%
- Other: 97.6%
- White: 100%

Percentage of EL Status Across Race and Ethnicity
- Hispanic: 30.4%
- Asian: 17.8%
- Black: 15.8%
- Other: 3.7%
- White: 2.4%
Gap between teachers of color and students of color in MA School Districts

The graph shows the difference between the share of students of color and the share of teachers of color in school districts with 50%+ students of color (small to largest gap). Source: DESE. Analysis: MABE and Gaston institute.
Top 20 MA school districts with the largest (1,000+) EL populations (AY21)

Source: DESE. Analysis: MABE and Gaston institute.
MA School districts at least 10% EL students (1,000 or less). AY21

These districts enroll approximately 9% of all ELs in the state. Source: DESE. Analysis: MABE and Gaston institute.
Distribution of students by percentage of “High Needs” students - AY 2019

A student is “High Needs” if he or she is designated as either economically disadvantaged, or ELL, or former ELL, or a student with disabilities.

A student is economically disadvantaged if participates in one or more state-administered programs: SNAP; the Transitional Assistance for Families with Dependent Children (TAFDC); the Department of Children and Families' (DCF) foster care program; and MassHealth. **Source:** Massachusetts DESE, 2019. Gaston institute analysis.
Research Supports Dual Language Education

Dr. Mary Cazabon brings experience in design and inception of innovative research-based programs for English Learners (ELs) and English-only students in Dual Language Programs in Spanish, Portuguese, and Mandarin as well as in Integrated Foreign Language Programs in Mandarin and Korean.
Academic Results

Research proves it!

Narrows/eliminates achievement gap.
How do ELs fare in DLE? (Lindholm-Leary & Genesee, 2014)

ELs attain English proficiency by grades 5-7.

ELs reach comparatively similar or higher levels in content-area academic achievement to English-home speaking peers.

ELs are more likely to complete high school, take advanced placement courses, & have positive attitudes toward school.
English Learners’ Long-Term Achievement by Program Model

W. Thomas y V. Collier, 2001-2009

- A longitudinal 4-year study of students randomly assigned to DLE programs in Portland OR.
  - Randomization eliminates selection bias and improves ability to infer causation (not just correlation).
  - Study examined both Two-Way and One-Way DLE on a district-wide scale with 12 schools by tracking students from K-8.
Research proves it!

Positive Intergroup Relations

*English speakers are welcome.*
Highlights of Socio-Cultural Results of Reciprocal Interdependence

- Students display an orientation of integrative motivation by their choice of responses on the Cross-Cultural Attitude Survey.

- African Americans and Latinos indicate the strongest degree of integrative motivation across most grade levels demonstrating that for them the presence of the “other” is critical to their learning in a bilingual environment.

(Cazabón, 2000)
Increased Social Justice & Equity

English speakers are welcome.

Higher Ed support & Collaboration
Equity & Social Justice

Reciprocal interdependence is mutually beneficial to both groups of students and enables the possibility of Equity and Social Justice for our language minoritized students:

• 1. Latinx and ELs gain high quality English while maintaining and perfecting their first language and affirming their cultural heritage.
• 2. English speakers gain a second language and cross-cultural respect and understanding (an elusive accomplishment in American education in the United States).
• 3. Social justice and equity are closer to becoming a reality in our classrooms and within our schools.
Comparison of Mean Scores (Scale of 0-10)
Cambridge Public Schools Survey Responses in Favor of TBE, DLE, ESL & SEI (Cazabon, 2014): Which program do you think is best for EL students? (Cazabón, M. 2014)
DLE Research Attests to its Commitment to Equity and Social Justice
Mary Cazabón (Lesley University) & Fabián Torres-Ardila (Gastón Institute/UMass Boston)
Research Resources


Challenges to the Implementation of DLE Programs

Dr. Susan McGilvray-Rivet is a retired bilingual teacher, program director, and principal. She is currently coaching and supporting dual language principals and schools and supervising student teachers.
**Collaborating, Connecting, & Cooperating for Dual Language Education - MA**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Current Legislation that Supports DLE Chapter 71A</th>
<th>Licensure for DLE Teachers</th>
<th>What is Needed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>● Recent revisions through the LOOK ACT - allow districts to decide language education program model</td>
<td>● Bilingual Education Endorsement - requirements for teachers who teach content in language other than English</td>
<td>● More DLE programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Programs shall be based on best practices in the field and the linguistic and educational needs and the demographic characteristics of English learners in the school district.</td>
<td>● 5 IHE’s approved: UMASS Amherst, Boston College, Lesley University, Bridgewater State, UMASS Boston</td>
<td>● Assessment &amp; Accountability for partner language in addition to meeting standards in content in English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>■ Funds for planning and implementation of new DLE programs</td>
<td>● ESL license or SEI Endorsement for teachers who teach in English</td>
<td>● Alternative pathways for teacher license</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>■ Funds for preparing teachers to earn the BEE</td>
<td></td>
<td>● Increased hiring of diverse staff</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Curriculum - culturally responsive, thematic based units embedding science and social studies**
Voices from the Field

Teacher Voices:
- Irmarie Padilla (Southbridge)
- Laura Espinoza Mufson (Holyoke)
Q & A